1 PTS GROSS

2 GROSS

3

4 COMMISSION ON SECURITY AND

5 COOPERATION IN EUROPE

6 INTERNATIONAL FEDERATION FOR

7 ELECTORAL SYSTEMS (IFES) BRIEFING ON

8 ELECTORAL REFORMS IN RUSSIA

9 Friday, December 9, 1994

10 Washington, D.C.

11

12

13

14 The briefing was held in Room 2322, Rayburn House Office

15 Building, Washington, D.C., at 2:00 p.m.

16

17 PRESENT:

18 John Finerty, CSCE Host

19 Catherine Barnes

20 Robert Dahl

21 Terry Holcomb

22 Connie McCormack

23 Richard Soudrette

24

25 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

26

27 [2:00 p.m.]

28 Mr. FINERTY. Good afternoon. My name is John Finerty. On
29 behalf of the Chairman, and the Co-Chairman, Mr. DeConcini
30 and Mr. Hoyer, and the other members of the Helsinki
31 Commission, I'd like to welcome you here to this briefing by
32 the International Federation for Electoral Systems.

33 I'm going to turn the microphone over right now to Mr.
34 Richard Soudrette, who is the director of the International
35 Federation, and he will say a few words, and then we'll move
36 right into the panel discussion. Thank you.

37 Mr. SOUDRETTE. Well, I'd like to thank John and the
38 Committee for arranging for this briefing this afternoon. On
39 behalf of the International Federation for Electoral
40 Systems, it's a pleasure for us to be here with you to talk
41 about one of our favorite countries, and one of the
42 countries that, of course, is one of the most important in
43 terms of our relationship between the United States and
44 Russia.

45 We--it's especially fitting that we're having this
46 briefing, because we're virtually on ~~the eve~~ of the
47 parliamentary elections that were held last year. And so,
48 the purpose of this briefing really is to take a moment, to
49 go back, to take a look at what has happened over the past

75 technical assistance to the CEC, as well as we played a
76 major role in helping to coordinate the information flow for
77 all the international observers for last year. We have
78 continued to work on the ground, and you'll hear more about
79 the projects that we have been doing here this afternoon.
80 One thing I would like to mention is, as an example of the
81 close relationship that we have developed in working with
82 the CEC, in November, we hosted the Chairman of the CEC, Mr.
83 Nikolai Ryabov, who came here to observe our U.S.
84 Congressional elections.
85 We brought him here to Washington and thennotthe only
86 reason that we decided to take him out to see the real world
87 was Chairmanthe Vice Chairman of the Federal Election
88 Commission, Danny McDonald, and myself, are both from
89 Oklahoma. So, we took him out to see how elections are run
90 in the heartland of America. And he really enjoyed it, and
91 it continued to help strengthen the relationship that we
92 have had between our institution and the CEC.
93 Today, we would like to focus in detail on what has
94 happened, and where things are going. And it's a pleasure to
95 have our distinguished panel. We have with us Terry Holcomb,
96 who has been a civic education specialist, who has been
97 working with us extensively in Russia.
98 We have Connie McCormack who ishas just recently accepted
99 a position to be working in Moscow. She is very well known

100 here in the U.S. election community. She was the head of
101 elections, the chief administrator, for San Diego, and we're
102 very pleased that she is coming on board with us, and is
103 going to be working with us. And we'll hear from her today.
104 Robert Dahl, formerly with the Federal Election
105 Commission, was there all throughout the project that we did
106 last year, and has spent extensive time there this year. And
107 we're very pleased that he'll be here today, and will be
108 sharing his thoughts. Commissioner Danny McDonald from
109 the Federal Election Commission will also be joining us. We
110 had just received a call, he's on the way. So we willhe will
111 also be joining us a little bit later in the program.
112 And then finally, last but certainly not least, Catherine
113 Barnes, who is a person at our Foundation who really stays
114 on top, and keeps the programs going. She's the senior
115 program officer in charge of the former Soviet Union. So,
116 we're very pleased to have her today, and she will be
117 serving as the moderator for this discussion.
118 Again, I'd like to thank all of you for coming, and we
119 look forward to any of your comments and questions during
120 the question and answer period. Thank you.
121 Ms. BARNES. I'd just like to begin by making a few
122 comments on the IFES program in Russia, and then I will
123 introduce the speakers who will be talking about the reforms
124 that have been implemented since last December, as well as

125 some of the challenges that are still facing the Central
126 Election Commission of Russia, and the government of Russia,
127 in trying to consolidate democratic institutions.
128 The program largely focuses on five areas. The first is
129 legal reform. The December 12th elections were conducted by
130 Presidential decree. That decree was made up of a number of
131 election law proposals. Many of its articles were
132 inconsistent with each other, and there were a lot of gaps
133 that did not address the practical realities of
134 administering an election in Russia under competitive
135 circumstances.
136 So, when this commission was established as a permanent
137 Commission in December, they were tasked with coming up with
138 federal election legislation to submit to the State Duma, to
139 try to rectify the gaps, and the insufficiencies of the
140 federal electoral code, as early as January and February,
141 while results were still coming in from the December
142 elections, they set up a special task force on election law,
143 and decided that the first activity they would undertake
144 would be a voting rights act, which would serve as the
145 conceptual framework for all subsequent legislation.
146 Bob Dahl is going to be commenting on that a little bit
147 later. The bill was submitted to the Duma in April. There
148 were some contentious points in that bill, particularly
149 concerning the permanent status of the Commission, and the

150 formula for its appointment.

151 The bill was not passed by the Duma until October 26th. It
152 has been forwarded then to the upper house, that was passed
153 on November 16th, and the bill is currently in Yeltsin's
154 office. It should be signed this week, or next week.

155 So, that's important legislation that has been passed in
156 the year since elections. That really opens the door for a
157 lot of other federal electoral legislation that needs to be
158 passed, primarily laws on parliamentary elections,
159 presidential elections, and constitutional referenda.

160 ISIS advisors in Moscow have been working with the Central
161 Election Commission, and reviewing their draft laws, to
162 review them for consistency, for depth, to make sure that
163 they address some of the weak points that occurred last
164 December.

165 And a number of the laws that are just in draft form right
166 now are being reviewed. Our panel will share some of their
167 initial impressions with you, and we will be coming out with
168 written recommendations on how to improve these laws before
169 they are actually implemented.

170 In addition to actual legislation at the federal level, as
171 you may know, there are a lot of local and regional
172 elections going on right now, in the absence of any federal
173 model. Therefore, the laws by all of the regions, subjects
174 of the federations and localities, are quite different. A

175 lot of them are not particularly good. They've had a lot of
176 problems in administering their elections.
177 And without benefit of some federal legislation, have sort
178 of been going on it, moving forward with that on their own.
179 As a result of that situation, the CEC has established a
180 special task force, to try to develop model legislation for
181 the lower levels. And CEC advisors are also participating in
182 that task force.
183 Through our office, we also provide some support in
184 institutional reform. One of the major criteria for free and
185 fair democratic elections is the establishment of a
186 permanent, independent, and professional Commission. The
187 current Commission has 22 members, all of whom were
188 appointed by President Yeltsin.
189 lot of questions were raised about their independence
190 from the Presidential administration in the conduct of
191 elections. Bob will be telling you a little bit more about
192 changes in the formula for appointment that make it a bit
193 more representative, and allows for appointments by the
194 Parliament, as well as the Presidential administration.
195 Efforts also to make the Commission accountable to the
196 Republic are under way. Bob Dahl has worked with
197 Commissioners on the CEC for some time to establish a public
198 archive, which establishes an institutional memory for the
199 commission, and allows for public access to election

200 results, campaign finance information, and other documents
201 relating to Russia's post Soviet elections.
202 In support of those activities, a lot of training is done
203 in the area of procedural reform. Once the laws are passed,
204 and in place, a lot of administrative tasks need to be
205 undertaken, to ensure that from polling site procedures, to
206 ballot security, the law is realized in its intent.
207 IFES is working both with the Central Election Commission,
208 through an election official and poll watcher training
209 program, poll worker training program, excuse me, to improve
210 the efficiency and professionalism, and diversity of
211 Commission members at lower levels, as well as doing direct
212 work with regional election Commissions.
213 Two other areas in which IFES works revolve around
214 dissemination of information about the new electoral system.
215 In recent regional and local elections, voter apathy has led
216 to the invalidation of quite a few elections. Not enough
217 people have turned out to vote. International observers
218 have commented on the lack of understanding, the relative
219 confusion of many of the votes about the new systems, the
220 new forms of balloting, and new forms of representation.
221 The CEC has placed new emphasis on voter education
222 initiatives, particularly those directed toward young
223 people, because young people have been noticeably absent at
224 the polling stations, something that was not the situation

225 in Eastern Europe.

226 Therefore, they have worked with IFES to design a first
227 time voters program, to encourage the active participation
228 of people who will vote for the first time in the Duma
229 elections of 1995, or in the Presidential elections of 1996.
230
231 And finally, our office does operate an election resource
232 center in Moscow, that's a depository for information on
233 comparative election systems, as well as Russia's evolving
234 electoral system.

235 There are English and Russian language versions of
236 materials on campaign finance, election laws, poll worker
237 training, polling place procedures, ballot security, those
238 types of things, that's accessible to all election
239 officials, political party representatives, government
240 officials, and members of the diplomatic and development
241 communities. Eventually, all of those materials will be
242 donated to a CEC public archive.

243 At this point, I would like to turn the floor over to our
244 panel, to discuss some of the federal legislation that has
245 been put into place, as well as some of the other priorities
246 of the Central Election Commission in addressing the
247 criticisms of international observers, and the weak points
248 of their elections last December, as well as some of the
249 obstacles that continue to remain in Russia's

250 democratization process.

251 The first speaker will be Bob Dahl, who was the former
252 project manager in Russia, was present for the December
253 elections. And he'll be commenting on the voting rights
254 legislation which is considered by the CEC to be their major
255 accomplishment in 1994.

256 Mr. DAHL. Thank you. I might give a little context to the
257 presentation today about IFES' involvement with the CEC.
258 When I went over there last year, in October, before the
259 election, all of us are familiar with how dramatic the
260 changes have been in the Soviet Union, and the break- up of
261 the Soviet Union, and the development of democracy in the
262 former Communist world.

263 Try to imagine how that has happened administratively,
264 with the elections being called in September of last year,
265 and the elections being conducted under the decree of the
266 President, the Central Election Commission being organized
267 very quickly and hastily, to accommodate these plans for
268 elections.

269 The CEC, which is responsible for setting up the hierarchy
270 of Commissions throughout the country that culminated in
271 close to 95,000 polling places participating in the
272 elections on December 12th '93.

273 And of course, in the middle of all that, was the
274 confrontation with the Parliament, at the Russian White

275 House, that resulted in bloodshed, and violence, and called
276 into question the very legitimacy of the entire regime.
277 And so, we got over there roughly two weeks after the
278 violence at the White House, and began working with the CEC
279 as they tried to organize for the elections.
280 After the elections were over, eight days after the
281 elections were over, the President then made the CEC a
282 permanent institution, and part of its mandate was to begin
283 development for these election laws. And we were somewhat
284 surprised, I think initially, they chose the route of a
285 basic statement of the guarantees of electoral rights of
286 voters that, instead of getting into specific election laws,
287 they wanted to have this comprehensive document.
288 But I think it's proved to be a good move by the CEC, and
289 by the government generally because, number one, it does
290 lock into place the most fundamental freedoms and rights
291 that we take for granted here, and that we always associate
292 with democracy, and it makes it unnecessary for those rights
293 and guarantees to be repeated, and to be re- enacted every
294 time an election law is passed.
295 So thesethe law that was recently passed by the Federation
296 Council, the Duma, and that awaits the President's
297 signature, really provides a floor from which all the rest
298 of the election laws can be based, and I think marks a very
299 significant turning point in Russia, because now they really

300 have, in fact, established democracy that theythey have put
301 into writing and committed themselves to.
302 I might also note that the constitution that was adopted
303 last December also provides for certain basic principles and
304 freedoms. It begins with the point that the rights of
305 mankind are to be guaranteed by this date. It establishes
306 the principles of political diversity in a multi-party
307 system. It guarantees freedom of thought, and speech, and
308 provides for a prohibition upon censorship by the government
309 of information.
310 It guarantees the right of association, and the freedom of
311 activity by associations. It guarantees the right to
312 peaceably assemble, the right to participate in public
313 affairs by electing and being elected to government bodies.
314 So now, this recently passed federal law for the basic
315 guarantees of electoral rights is designed to implement
316 those constitutional guarantees, most specifically the right
317 to elect and to be elected. And it fills in that level of
318 rights, between the constitutional rights that were just
319 discussed, and those rights that will flow from the
320 operation of the specific laws as they are developed, the
321 laws regarding the elections to the Duma, the elections for
322 President, the elections for state, Republic, and local
323 elections, and also the referendum.
324 I'll just run over some of the most important principles

that are contained in the new law regarding the basic guarantees. It establishes the right of self-government, and states that the legitimacy of the government is dependent upon expression of free will by the voters.

It sets out that the scope of this law applies to all elections, to all levels of government throughout the Russian Federation. Therefore, for theat the beginning of this process, it establishes the supremacy of the federal law. It does permit legislative bodies of the subject Republics to expand upon this guarantee, and to enact additional guarantees, electoral rights, in their area.

The new law institutionalizes electoral associations, that is, political parties, and also electoral blocs, which are the coalitions of the parties. It provides for the voluntary equal, and direct electoral right, by secret ballot. It guarantees the right to elect and be elected regardless of sex, race, nationality, origin, language, religion, beliefs, associations, place of residence, property, or official status.

The law establishes a hierarchy of electoral Commissions, central, subject to a Republic level, district, which is constituency, local and precinct level, the polling place. The law describes these electoral Commission's respective responsibilities.

It guarantees their independence, and requires cooperation

350 from other governmental bodies and private groups in the
351 operation of electoral Commissions, and requires the
352 electoral Commissions to operate in an open and in a public
353 manner.

354 The law also provide guarantees for equality among
355 candidates. It guarantees them the right to freely campaign,
356 and a right to equal access to the media, and to public
357 facilities. And even though the law is meant to be a floor,
358 or basic guarantee of rights, it does have some
359 interestingly specific guarantees and procedures outlined,
360 that will be a feature of all the election laws that are
361 subsequently passed.

362 To begin with, it provides for a system of voter
363 registries, sets out the resporsibility of local authorities
364 to administer these voter registries, provides for
365 individual legal rights and requirements, in terms of being
366 registered as a voter, and procedures for appealing your
367 exclusion from the voter registry.

368 The law provides for the formation of electoral districts,
369 that is, constituencies, sets out the responsibility of the
370 local authorities for forming the districts, sets out
371 guidelines and requirements for the relative equality of
372 these electoral districts, including a maximum allowable
373 deviation of ten percent of the average rate of
374 representation. And it provides that these district lines

375 respect existing administrative divisions.

376 The law also provides for the formation of electoral
377 precincts, which is again the responsibility of local
378 authorities, with a maximum of 3,000 voters per precinct,
379 and also provides for the providing of polling places for
380 the military, rest homes, and other extraordinary polling
381 sites.

382 The law details the formation of the Central Electoral
383 Commission, its composition, and member qualifications. Five
384 are to be selected by the Federation Council, five by the
385 Duma, and five by the President. It sets out the Central
386 Electoral Commission's primary responsibilities, including
387 organizing the systems for voter registration, tabulating
388 election returns, and funding of the election
389 administration.

390 It surprisingly provides for rather specific voting
391 procedures and operations of the electoral Commissions
392 themselves. It provides for procedures for filing complaints
393 regarding electoral commission actions, and also for
394 appealing decisions of the electoral Commissions.

395 It sets out a general procedure for the nomination and
396 registration of candidates by electoral associations and
397 blocks, including a requirement for secret ballot for
398 nomination votes by party meetings, and a procedure for
399 direct nomination of candidates by groups of voters other

400 than parties.

401 It provides for candidate funding, including specifying
402 there will be public funding for parties and their
403 candidates, also allowing private funding and voluntary
404 donations.

405 It describes in considerable detail the voting procedure,
406 counting and tabulation procedures, including a prohibition
407 on voting by one person for other persons, which has been a
408 problem in previous Russian elections, and a cultural
409 problem.

410 It guarantees secret ballot, by requiring the use of
411 voting booths, and a prohibition upon any attempt to
412 interfere or influence voting. And of course it also
413 provides for the traditional portable ballot box, or the
414 flying box, as it's known in Russian election procedure.

415 It sets out the rights of candidates and parties, and also
416 international observers, to monitor the entire voting,
417 counting, and tabulation process, and it sets forth that
418 voting material shall be preserved no less than one year in
419 every voting situation, and provides for an immediate right
420 to examine the voting materials after the election by
421 candidates, and by the public, and publication of complete
422 election results within three months after the election.

423 Having gone over the highlights of the law, and certainly
424 I'm willing to answer questions about it later, I might also

425 note that a couple aspects of our involvement that speak to
426 the basic openness of the system is that thethose of us
427 working with IFES in Russia are trying to work with the CEC
428 to open up two areas to greater disclosure.
429 Having worked with the FEC in the U.S., where we have
430 close to 300 staff people concerned exclusively with
431 campaign finance regulation for federal elections, we were
432 taken aback by the fact that in the CEC of Russia, there are
433 nine people assigned to campaign finance regulation for all
434 levels of elections.
435 And they do actually try to organize, and make available
436 the reports that are sent in by candidates and parties
437 regarding their funding, but there is no regularized forms,
438 there's no certain requirements for what has to be reported,
439 and it's inaccessible as far as the public at this point,
440 because they simply haven't got the physical space to
441 provide for it.
442 But we would like to assist them in developing a more
443 organized and accessible system for examining how money is
444 raised and spent by candidates for office in Russia. The
445 other area of disclosure we're trying to work more closely
446 with, the CEC that is also alluded to in this law, is the
447 whole complaint and grievance process.
448 Because frankly, we have no idea how various complaints
449 and grievances were resolved throughout the country last

450 December. We received anecdotal evidence, we would give
451 reports of decisions by election Commissions at the local
452 level. But there needs to be developed a body of law so
453 that these decisions aren't reinvented every time, that they
454 are consistent, that there is some precedent to follow, that
455 voters, and candidates, and parties, and other election
456 participants have some idea of the development of the law,
457 and the interpretation of the law by the election
458 commissions.

459 So, with that, I'll turn the program back to Catherine.

460 Ms. BARNES. Thank you. Now that this legislation has been
461 passed, the Central Election Commission has submitted
462 several draft laws for consideration, primarily those
463 relating to the election of the Duma. Duma Deputies,
464 according to the Constitution, have a four year term. But
465 because of a special Presidential decree on the transition
466 period, this Duma technically is to be up for election again
467 in 1995, that is, the end date of the previous Supreme
468 Soviet that it replaced.

469 Therefore, there's a lot of political discussion and
470 maneuvering concerning the passage of a parliamentary
471 election law that has been forwarded to the Duma, and is
472 currently under consideration. And Connie McCormack will be
473 offering some comments on that draft legislation.

474 Ms. MCCORMACK. Thank you, Catherine. Before I do that, I

475 think all of us have spent part of our lives in a time warp,
476 and I'd just like to have you close your eyes for a second,
477 and picture this warp speed, because this is really my first
478 day on the job with IFES, however, I will tell you in a
479 second, another experience.
480 But in the last 48 hours, I have moved out of my house in
481 San Diego, got on a plane, had this law FedEx-ed to me a day
482 and a half ago, came on the red-eye last night, and am
483 starting on to a whole new endeavor.
484 So, if you can just sort of picture my mental state of
485 having about three hours sleep for the lastactually, two
486 weeks ago today, I was flying back from Moscow, and I think
487 I've averaged three to four hours since then, sca night.
488 So, you can kind of get my mental state here.
489 But it was really worth going to Moscow two weeks ago,
490 when I came back, the day after Thanksgiving, because I
491 couldn't start the job then, but there was a very historic
492 conference going on for the electoral Commissions, and all
493 over the country. And they had an incredible representation
494 of 85 out of the 88 regions where they are represented for
495 this conference.
496 And it was the first time they had ever invited
497 international election speakers. And myself, and the
498 chairman of the Australian Electoral Commission were invited
499 to speak. And it was very well received. There were so many

500 questions, they actually had to cut off the questioning
501 period.
502 There was a lot of curiosity, but also substantive
503 questions, that I think was very valuable. In that time,
504 Chairman Ryabov, who Richard Scudrette mentioned, had come
505 to the United States for the election on November 8th, did
506 speak very glowingly of that experience. He spoke
507 extensively for about ten minutes in his comments about the
508 Tulsa, Oklahoma, experience, and his total amazement at how
509 fast the ballots are cast in this country.
510 He was just completelyin his whole description of it, and
511 this is describing it to people from all over the country
512 now, who didn't know, you know, anything about it, or that
513 he had even gone. And it was irteresting hearing his
514 perspective, and the perspective was, first of all, they're
515 doing it with these little precincts, with three little old
516 ladies.
517 And they can whip through these precincts, and put these
518 ballots on these little computers, and out come these
519 results a few hours laterwhen he was describing, of course,
520 all the audience knew, they were running the elections
521 throughout the country, 14 to 15 people in precincts taking
522 four to five hours to close the polls, and then days,
523 potentially, to get any reporting of the results.
524 So, this was a very good PR, I think, to explain, and then

525 Tulsa, Oklahoma, which is actually very advanced. They
526 haveOklahoma has a very advanced election system, I hate to
527 say it, even moresc than San Diego. But we think of a
528 prettyI was also kind of involved in the November 8th
529 election, too. I was still running that for San Diego.
530 And we still are involved with a tie vote out there in one
531 of our elections. And one of the things, when I was reading
532 this law, that I'm going to review in a second, is how the
533 resolution of tie votes, that'sin this law, in a different
534 way. I think maybe we ought to think about that in
535 California, the recommendation.
536 In reviewing this law, which is extremely comprehensive,
537 you know, in California our election code, and I think in
538 most states it's about thick, and I know I personally have
539 never read every section of it, and I was out there for
540 seven years running it.
541 So, you know, you run to that section, and try to read it
542 one minute ahead of the next lawyer who comes in to question
543 you on it. This was extremely comprehensive. It's about 50
544 pages, and I'm sure you'll all get a copy if you haven't
545 already, and it does address so many areas of the law in
546 very specifics.
547 There are other areas that are quite vague, and leave a
548 lot of autonomy to the local election Commissions, which
549 could be good, or could be bad, and I think I want to do

550 some further analysis. There could be a lot of
551 inconsistencies, which I do think there has been some
552 concern about.
553 But on the whole, it's extremely comprehensive. It does
554 lay out specific time frames for the beginning of the
555 process. In '93 I understand the election was called in
556 September, they had a revolution in October, and pulled the
557 election off in December.
558 As an election official in California, we have a five and
559 a half month period from candidate filing to the election
560 date, and another month to certify. I can't even begin to
561 imagine trying to do it in that period of time, and that's
562 in an area where we have procedures, and laws, and voting
563 equipment that is actually very consistent, and supposedly
564 understandable.
565 So, in this new law, it does lay out a four month
566 pre-election planning period, which I think is fairly
567 significant. It's certainly better than two. And unless
568 there's a dissolution of the Duma in some sort of
569 circumstance where the President decides to dissolve the
570 parliamentary system earlier, then there's a three month
571 compressed time frame to conduct the election with,
572 subsequent reduction of the campaigning period. But that
573 still is not that, you know, impossible to do.
574 The major significant charge over what the operation of

575 the Presidential decree in '93 appears to be the actual
576 structure of the 450 Deputies of the Duma. In the last
577 election, I believe it was 225 to 225? Huh.
578 See, one thing about being someone whomy husband always
579 says I don't know how to add at all. It's perfect. Everybody
580 always trusts my election results, because I couldn't have
581 had anything to do with it. 225 to 225. Now, it's 300 single
582 mandate districts, and 150 party lists.
583 So, it is definitely giving a lot of weight to the single
584 mandate district, which is the one-man, one-vote concept
585 we're familiar with, and one-person, one- district,
586 one-Deputy concept. The rationale and the reasoning behind
587 that I'm not specifically familiar with, but that's a
588 significant change that probably needs some further
589 analysis, and will impact, you know, the conduct and the
590 potential government.
591 The bill is very specific on electionalelectoral funding.
592 It talks about the funding of the actual process, in
593 addition to candidate financing, which of course is another
594 area. But the actual implementation, logistics of election
595 planning is laid out with the federal line item in the
596 budget, so thatand specific dates of when the CEC will
597 actually get the funding in their budget, so that is all
598 laid out.
599 A lot of what Bob covered with the electoral guarantees is

600 again repeated in this law, but fleshed out more. It's given
601 a lot more specificity, especially with the powers of the
602 CEC, which are significant, including judicial determination
603 of thesome of those beginning complaints, when people come
604 in and make complaints, I know in my office, and in most in
605 the United States, when people come in and allege even a
606 fraud, or errors, especially if it has anything to do with
607 illegalities, it immediately goes to the next branch of
608 government, the district attorney, the judicial branch.
609 And this would appear to give significant authority to the
610 CEC. And then if there's questions, an appellatean appeal
611 process goes into the Supreme Court immediately. And I
612 really like the fact that it does lay out, similar to our
613 writ of mandate proceedings, very narrow time frame for
614 these judicial remedies to occur, usually within three days.
615
616 I think that's really very excellent. I don't know whether
617 it's going to happen. Again, this is the law. As practiced,
618 it may be something else. But the fact that it's been
619 documented in this law, that there is going to be resolution
620 of these complaints. And if the complaint comes to them on
621 election day, it will be resolved in court that day. That's
622 significant, and it's actually what we operate in California
623 with the writ of mandate proceedings. We're usually in court
624 all day, election day, with different candidates, and

625 different problems.

626 It does lay out campaignspecific campaign finance limits
627 for candidates, that's laid out in the law. It talks very
628 specifically about these districts, single mandate
629 districts, and how much they can deviate with the one- man,
630 one-vote concept which Bob mentioned, the ten percent,
631 that's a pretty wide variance, 15 percent in a rural area.
632 But again, that's not terriblyI don't think it's real
633 significant.

634 A lot of time frames are laid out for precincting lists,
635 and voter lists, and it indicates as aI think it sounds like
636 it's a mandatory voter registration process for anyone of
637 eligibility age, and that the voter lists are compiled in
638 the districts in February, and in July. I'm interested in
639 learning more about that. I don't know whether that'swhat
640 kind of dead wood or problems they have with that.

641 It sets up the hierarchy of those electoral Commissions,
642 which we certainly have in this country, too, with county
643 governments, and state governments, and all these reporting
644 of election results, and how long that takes. And it lays
645 out some deadlines andthat are really pretty slow. And it's
646 potentiallyhopefully, it's at the very worst, it can be
647 three to five days in this one category, or a week. But it'd
648 be nicer if it could be quicker.

649 It talks about the invalid elections, when a threshold of

650 at least 25 percent of the vote has not been reached, the
651 election is invalid. And that's been a significant problem,
652 especially in a lot of the local elections in the last year.
653 And I wonder if that's anyif there's any reasoning for that
654 having to do with how good the lists are, how clean the
655 lists are, how valid, or accurate the lists are. That
656 probably needs to be examined, because that's really a
657 problem when, you know, you can't even get the vote.
658 It also talks about the candidates must not take a
659 plurality of the vote. They have to get a majority of the
660 vote. And that can invalidate an election, too. So, if you
661 have a lot of candidates, and if one person doesn't get more
662 votes than all the rest of the candidates, and the none of
663 the above, against all candidates, it's one of the
664 categories.
665 Very specific polls closing procedures, again, this has
666 not been thoroughly analyzed. It's a day and a half off the
667 translation presses. But the tie resolution I talked to you
668 about, we've had three ties in San Diego in the last three
669 years. I don't know why. We just keep getting these tie
670 votes.
671 And one of our districts got real excited about this, and
672 a bunch of lawyers got involved, so you can imagine what the
673 complexity of this was. So, what we ended up with was a
674 three page, single spaced document on how to flip a coin, I

kid you not. It's wonderful. I've got to get it published somewhere.

Three pages on, you know, how high the coin has to go in the air, what happens if it hitsch, how you appoint observers to see whether or not, you know, tohow it hit when itand how you pick the coin. There's a page on what the quarter has to be, and what years. I mean, I kid you not. It goes on and on.

So, three pages of final resolution of a tie vote which we have used with this document of procedures. They're very thorough, amazingly thorough. But in this document, it talks about tie resolutions go to the candidate who registered first, you know? You get in there first, you know? ThatI like that, because we have a problem with our candidates always registering on the last day. So, if you thought, gee, I might get in one of these tie votes, I better get in there on the first day. So, I thought this was kind of good. I'll submit this to the California Legislature.

Again, I'll be glad to accept some questions. I see a friend in the back, Kim Brace, with election data. I have to make a comment. When I walked into the CEC offices over in Moscow, and I don't think they did this for us, I looked at the pins, to see if they were newly put in the wall. There was one of Kim's maps. If you know Kim, he does these wonderful maps of the United States with all these beautiful

700 colored documents, and you have to be, like, a math genius
701 to figure it out.
702 But it looks really pretty, and it has all the counties in
703 the United States. And for the '92 the Perot vote, and the
704 Bush vote, and the Clinton vote, very colorful and
705 interesting. And there it was, hanging in the offices in
706 Russia. So, when I got back, I had to call Kim and tell him
707 that, so now he tells me he's going to give me the new hot
708 off the press '94 one to take over there. So, it'll probably
709 be all one color, don't you think, after the(Laughter.) It'd
710 be easier to understand, I think, for those of us who aren't
711 math geniuses. Anyway, I'd like to turn the program over to
712 Terry, unless anyone has any questions.
713 Mr. HOLCOMB. By way of introduction, I'd like to make just
714 a couple of observations that are relevant to the work that
715 all of us do there. I think as we all know, Russia is going
716 through an extraordinary period of change.
717 We tend to see that as primarily a governmental system.
718 But I think we need to recognize that this, in fact,
719 involves all systems of human activity within that country.
720 Virtually every area of human activity is going through
721 systemic change.
722 The remarkable thing in terms of our work is that in view
723 of the recent relations of our country over the last four
724 decades with this country is that we have been invited to

725 participate in influencing this change. And I think that's
726 what we're about as an organization.
727 IFES' role in this is to be a catalyst for systemic
728 change. Now, in the case of the two people who have just
729 spoken, we're dealing with legal change. And I think we have
730 a unique opportunity to influence the next century of
731 Russia, and countries in this area, by the kinds of change
732 they make.
733 And the particular area that I work with, it's perhaps a
734 little different kind of work, because we're dealing
735 specifically with individuals, and the kind of education
736 that will go on in Russia.
737 In terms of a system that has broken down related to civic
738 education and voter education, it has virtually ceased
739 within the country. I mean, prior to the break-up of the
740 Soviet Union, there was an extensive system of teaching
741 about socialism, communist government. All of that has
742 virtually ceased. There is very little teaching of that kind
743 at all in the country.
744 As with the other systems, where there's been a breakdown,
745 something is going to replace it eventually. So, what we see
746 ourselves in this case, is having some ability to influence
747 the change that will take place in the years to come.
748 IFES' role in this specifically is targeted to voter
749 education. There are other agencies that work with the

750 broader area of civic education, dealing with all grades of
751 school. But our particular role is with training voters who
752 will soon be participating in the democratic process.
753 So, we narrowly defined our role as people 16 to 17 years
754 old for our initial project. Later projects might well deal
755 with voter education for people of all ages. But we felt the
756 biggest need was in this age group.
757 We felt this way because we did conduct three focus or our
758 research projects over the last six months in which we
759 literally were asking young people, how did they view the
760 process? Why weren't they voting? This sort of thing.
761 We found a lot of things, but it basically boiled down to
762 this. They didn't know much about the process. No one was
763 telling them about the process. And what little information
764 they did get was presented in an incredibly dull and
765 uninteresting way.
766 So, we tried then to be a catalyst for change by putting
767 together two agencies, one the Central Election Commission,
768 because that is our primary client organization in Russia,
769 and we felt they should participate in this project.
770 And two, the Ministry of Education itself. As you well
771 know with most bureaucracies around the world, major
772 agencies don't like to talk to each other very much. We
773 could be a catalyst by actually serving as a communication
774 link between the Ministry of Education, and the Central

775 Electoral Commission as a resource for the Ministry.

776 By bringing those groups together, we could then help

777 prepare a curriculum in voter education that could be used

778 throughout the Federation. And we did involve teachers in

779 this process by bringing together a select group of 40

780 educators from across the Federation, from as far away at

781 Yakutsk in the Russian far east.

782 We put them in a rural retreat for five days, with the

783 clear task to devise a one month, four week curriculum that

784 could be used for people 16 to 18 years old, that could be

785 presented to history teachers, and former civics teachers,

786 in such a way that anyone could teach this course by reading

787 this material.

788 Now, our intention was not simply to disseminate materials

789 and ideas, but rather to get Russians to take materials and

790 develop a curriculum that all of them could then use. We

791 felt that we did achieve success with that, as over the five

792 days, they did prepare a preliminary document. This has

793 been transmitted to the Central Election Commission and the

794 Ministry of Education.

795 We're now in the process of refining that document, and

796 pilot testing it throughout the Federation this year. If

797 we're successful in refining it, it is the intention of the

798 Ministry of Education then to provide this material for

799 schools throughout the Federation, prior to the elections in

800 1996.

801 In any case, this is a curriculum that could be used in
802 all Russian schools, starting with the '96 and '97 school
803 year. We've had three pilot tests so far. One was in the
804 community of Natichi, in which coincidentally, they had a
805 special election at the time.

806 The teachers who did this pilot test were at the
807 conference in which the curriculum was devised, and they
808 specifically prepared this program to be a role playing
809 project to go with the special election that was occurring
810 at exactly the same time. It was a three week project.

811 A special program was conducted in the city of Kazan, in
812 the month of October, over a one month period. They did it
813 slightly differently. It was constructed there as a student
814 parliament, using 15 schools, in which student
815 representatives were elected from each of those schools, and
816 then they met as a student parliament citywide.

817 These findings have also been transmitted to other
818 educators, and to the Ministry. The most recent pilot test
819 is just concluding this week, at School 1265 in Moscow. This
820 was a comprehensive test, using the curriculum, among 60
821 senior level students at this particular school.

822 We'll be getting a report on that this week. We'll
823 continue pilot testing through this week, and refine the
824 project.

825 But let me emphasize again, that our projects in their
826 entirety, not just voter education, but in all of our legal
827 reforms, is to be a catalyst for change in Russia in a
828 positive way, and to provide resources and materials, so
829 that they can create systems that will maintain a democracy
830 well into the next century.
831 That's our program, and that's what we're trying to do.
832 Thank you.
833 Ms. BARNES. Just to add a few points to the panel
834 presentation, there are a number of other laws which are
835 being made available for you. A constitutional or public
836 referendum law is also being considered by the Duma. There
837 is some controversy surrounding that, because it includes a
838 list which has not before existed on topics which are not
839 appropriate or sanctioned, on which to hold referenda. One
840 of those impacts the election cycle itself.
841 Some of the political factions in the Duma have also
842 submitted versions of President election laws. The Yabloko
843 bloc has submitted a Presidential law which was considered,
844 but defeated. In reading through that, it is not very
845 comprehensive. It certainly tries to circumvent legal
846 precedent, that being the voter rights legislation in terms
847 of the composition of Election Commission, and does try to
848 sort of close out the Presidential Administration's
849 jurisdiction in the area of elections.

850 One of the most noteworthy points of that law was that it
851 set an upper age limit for the presidency, which would have
852 excluded Yeltsin from running for another term. That is
853 available, if you are interested in seeing it.
854 The Central Election Commission is also working on its own
855 version of a Presidential election law, and that should be
856 considered by the Duma this term, as well.
857 I'd like to open the floor to some questions, if there's
858 time for that. If there are any specific interests
859 concerning the electoral process in Russia. (Pause.) No
860 questions?
861 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) the 300districts, have they all
862 beenalready?
863 Ms. BARNES. No.
864 UNIDENTIFIED. I don't think so.
865 Mr. DAHL. There were 25 single member constituencies
866 developed last year. And I don't think anybody has seen
867 lines for the new ones, the new proposed
868 Ms. BARNES. The hierarchy is somewhat fluid at this point
869 in time, in that regional, special regional Commissions, the
870 88 Commissions Connie was talking about, have been set up to
871 oversee regional and local Commissions. And they are not
872 necessarily the same Commissions that dealt with the
873 elections last December.
874 And I think, depending on the timing of the passage of

875 this bill, that there will be a major overhaul of the
876 hierarchy itself, as well as questions of districting.
877 Districting has been called into question, even on a
878 Presidential decree on regional and local elections, which
879 also stipulates a variance that's not being abided by in
880 practice.

881 And you're having some electoral polling sites, with as
882 few as nine voters, and others over 2,000. So, a lot of work
883 needs to be done in the area of districting, as well.

884 Mr. DAHL. I might mention that we were surprised last year
885 how little controversy there seemed to be about the district
886 lines that were drawn. And that may have been simply because
887 people were having to move on to the campaign so quickly,
888 they couldn't really complain about those lines, or they
889 weren't even quite sure what to say about them.

890 But, you know, the CEC developed these constituency lines,
891 and published them, and the campaign moved on, and they
892 elected single member representatives on that basis. And as
893 I described, the Basic Law contemplates new line drawing
894 according to certain parameters.

895 But I think in some ways, it's a lack of political
896 sophistication, that as the parties develop, they'll learn
897 to complain about, and see the significance politically of
898 line drawing.

899 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) Am I right, assuming that they

900 will have an electoral college, that they'llthey will elect
901 theirelect their person directly, instead of electoral
902 college?
903 Mr. DAHL. The President?
904 Ms. MCCORMACK. We haven't seen the Presidential law yet.
905 But this is a Parliamentary
906 Mr. DAHL. Presumably I think you're right.
907 Ms. MCCORMACK. But I don't think anybody would want to
908 invent that. [Laughter.] I don't know how we did it.
909 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) One important safeguard against
910 fraud and abuseat the local polling stations, is having
911 different individuals work at the polling stations as
912 monitors from different parties. And since the party system
913 you have described is not sufficiently developed at this
914 point, particularly in rural areas, so that you have
915 diversive parties that can ensure that the rules are being
916 complied with, how do youhow do you address a problem like
917 that? What's the solution, or is there one?
918 Mr. DAHL. Well, the last round, a year ago, each candidate
919 was permitted five monitor's representatives, which got to
920 be kind of a joke, because there would have been thousands,
921 and thousands, or millions, some, I think, if every
922 candidate had taken advantage of his full entitlement to
923 representatives.
924 So, there was somewhere between the reality, which was to

925 say there wasn't a lot of monitoring by the parties and
926 candidates, and the potential, what the law provided for.
927 The law really needs to address a more institutionalized
928 basis for parties to watch each other, like we have in this
929 country, in most places.
930 Unlike other places in Eastern Europe, former Communist
931 countries, like in Eastern Europe, Bulgaria I'm thinking of,
932 Romania, where the election commissions are specifically
933 formed on the basis of party representatives. They start off
934 with a core of people who are presumed to be experts,
935 non-partisan, and qualified. And then, party representatives
936 are permitted to join after the candidates are nominated.
937 But there isn't a well developed, or even athere's only
938 the beginning, really, of a sense of competitive monitoring
939 by the parties.
940 Ms. FARNES. If I could just follow up on that question, in
941 terms of the thinking of the Central Election Commission, I
942 think there have been some interesting shifts in their
943 thinking, in terms of issues that they state as priorities,
944 issues which they're giving attention to publicly, which
945 were frankly non-existent last December.
946 There was a lot of discussion not only about political
947 party observers, but also non-partisan, access of non-
948 partisan observers. In areas that there were not political
949 parties, there at least might be civic organizations, or

950 labor unions, that could send observers.

951 The language that is coming out of the Central Election
952 Commission at this point in time from as high as the
953 Chairman's office, indicates that not only is the Commission
954 interested in designing professional training programs, to
955 insure that there is a consistent application of the law
956 between polling sites, but that there is also recognition
957 that since they have a party system, there is a need for
958 greater political diversification of those Commissions.

959 Which, frankly, to hear that kind of a statement out of
960 the Chairman of the Central Election Commission is fairly
961 revolutionary, in that a lot of these people have been
962 working on commissions for ten, 20, 30, 40 years, and most
963 of them do represent the Communist Party, formerly.

964 So, I think that there is a new initiative to try to pull
965 in in these training programs political party
966 representatives, so that they can become members of
967 Commissions, and not just poll watchers, which was
968 certainly, I think helped the situation.

969 I would also comment on the fact that the Central Election
970 Commission has made a real effort to include political
971 parties in this process. A lot of the election law working
972 groups that we did, political party representatives from the
973 Parliament were invited to attend, and have input.

974 As Connie can tell you, at this regional conference for

975 election officials, where they discussed the law, every
976 political party represented in the Duma was invited to make
977 a presentation. And virtually none of them showed up.
978 So, you're having a situation where the CEC is finally
979 becoming a bit more open, and including, and having a
980 dialogue, and the political parties that have been
981 complaining that they haven't been getting access, are now
982 failing, frankly, to have the type of input that they
983 wanted, just because they're not, when given the
984 opportunity, they're not forwarding input.
985 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) Are members of the Commission
986 full time paid professional staff at all levels? National?
987 MS. BARNES. No. The leadership at lower levels works for
988 specific elections on a full time basis. But there has not
989 been a permanent paid hierarchy. And that's something that
990 they are trying to address, to insure that they can have
991 professional Commissions, and that people are working on
992 them full time.
993 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) Is IFES involved, or will you be
994 involved in the training?
995 MS. BARNES. Yes. We will be conducting with the Central
996 Election Commission regional election management training
997 seminars. Frankly, the conference that Connie attended is
998 one of the first introductions to that. We will be traveling
999 with CEC to the regions to do programs there, basically

1000 instructing them or the new law.

1001 Because what you had December was a situation where there

1002 was a Presidential decree that was fairly recent. A lot of

1003 the poll workers weren't really familiar with it. There had

1004 been no training for those elections. And what they did was

1005 sort of fall back on tradition. And that tradition was the

1006 Communist tradition in administering elections.

1007 So, we will be very active in the regional training.

1008 Mr. DAHL. I might also note that in terms of the

1009 hierarchy, and the permanence of these Commissions,

1010 obviously the 95,000 polling places disband shortly after

1011 the election, as far as operation.

1012 And the election law last year contemplated that in

1013 regions, there was no real regional Commission, per se. Of

1014 the 225 constituency for the single mandate elections, which

1015 meanswhich include the fact that every Republic had at least

1016 one full constituency within its boundaries. But in places

1017 where there were more than one constituency Commission,

1018 withamong those within a Republic, one of those was chosen

1019 as sort of the slightly higher level, super constituency

1020 Commission.

1021 They called it dual mandate Commission, because it also

1022 was responsible for administration of the election to the

1023 Federation Council, where each Republic or subject two

1024 representatives. So, they don't even have, under the

1025 previous law, any sense of an ongoing regional Commission.
1026 Just these constituency Commissions, which really only apply
1027 to the Duma, having one of them of more exalted character.
1028 And this law contemplates that there will be a regional
1029 level Commission for each subject or Republic. And I think
1030 it's understood that they will have an ongoing function.
1031 Below that, the permanence, of course, is less significant,
1032 less necessary.
1033 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) Yes. I was wondering if you
1034 could review concretely who is deciding the portion when the
1035 State Dumaof deputies elected by single memberand by Party
1036 list, and howwhat sort of process you can use to makebecause
1037 obviously, it's very important politically how those
1038 proportions are set up. If Zhirinovsky wins so many seats
1039 Ms. BARNES. Yes. Frankly, to be very honest with you, this
1040 has been a significant debate within the Central Election
1041 Commission, what type of system is used for an election,
1042 whether it's a majoritarian system, or proportional, or
1043 mixed.
1044 And by and large, and this is not just governmental
1045 officials, or election officials, frankly, the democratic
1046 community, the academic community in Russia, had a very
1047 reactionary response to Zhirinovsky's victory. And that was
1048 that the reason that Zhirinovsky won, and did so well, was
1049 because of the proportional, the inclusion of proportional

1050 representation.

1051 Because he did very well on the Party lists, and he did
1052 not win very many seats in single mandate constituencies.
1053 And so, there was a push, even on the part of the extremely,
1054 you know, pro- democracy, or radical democracy political
1055 parties, to abandon proportional representation, which was
1056 not the case before last December's elections.

1057 Obviously, it's a very simplistic explanation for the
1058 results of December, and the fact that, you know, hasthere
1059 are a lot of issues that dealt with the results, certainly a
1060 lot of them dealing with campaign organization, and campaign
1061 themes, and attachmentor, the ability to address the Russian
1062 electorate, and the democrats certainly had some problems
1063 there.

1064 This I think is a compromise on the part of the CEC not to
1065 completely abandon the system, but to take a step back from
1066 it. There was some concern that obviously if you change the
1067 type of system you use as a result of the outcome of the
1068 election every time you have an election, then therefore the
1069 system does not have a great deal of integrity.

1070 I think it will be a big battle in the Duma on this
1071 question, because there are 225 Deputies there who were
1072 elected by the Party list, and they want to make sure that
1073 they get back. So --

1074 Mr. DAHL. I'd also note that probably the most significant

1075 feature of the electoral system in Russia from a comparative
1076 standpoint is the fact that these are really two separate
1077 forms of elections, and they're not integrated, they're not
1078 compensatory.

1079 For example, in West Germany, they have a combined remit
1080 system, but the Party list is meant to supplement the
1081 outcome in the single mandate constituencies. So that if you
1082 do very well on the single mandate constituencies, you will
1083 not receive a full share, according to the Party list vote,
1084 of the remaining seats, but just a compensatory
1085 distribution.

1086 So, the parties that come in second in a lot of single
1087 member constituencies, get compensated by the Party list
1088 vote. In Russia last year, it was 225 elected by single
1089 mandate, and a strictly separate 225 on the Party list vote.
1090 And my reading of the current law is the same system,
1091 andexcept a redistribution of the seats between the two
1092 types.

1093 And frankly, when you startthe smaller the pool of seats
1094 awarded by proportional, the less proportional and
1095 representive it really is. So, in many ways, this
1096 compromises, defeating the whole point of even bothering
1097 with the proportional vote.

1098 Ms. BARNES. If I could follow up on that also, at the
1099 regional level, regional elections, because of the lack of

1100 federal legislation, were conducted under Presidential
1101 decree, which gave great leeway to the regional authorities
1102 in developing their electoral code.
1103 And they were all provided with the option of using either
1104 a sole, majoritarian system, a mixed system, or Party list,
1105 using solely proportional representation. Only one region of
1106 Russia opted to use the mixed system. None of them used a
1107 pure proportional system.
1108 And that had to especially approved by the CEC. It was an
1109 experimental, basically pilot project. That was in Saratov
1110 region. They were the only people who did it. Moscow was
1111 supposed to have a mixed system, but they abandoned it, for
1112 some reason.
1113 We went down there on the technical assessment, to talk to
1114 the election authorities, and the government officials, and
1115 the political parties, and the voters, about what they
1116 thought about the use of a mixed system at the regional
1117 level. And frankly, they were very, very supportive of the
1118 use of a mixed system.
1119 They had about 37 percent voter turn-out, which for local
1120 elections was very high. They credit the use of a mixed
1121 system to having voter turn-out than the areas that just
1122 used the majoritarian system, because there was greater
1123 involvement on the part of the political parties.
1124 They also felt that people were move informed about the

1125 process, because of the political parties being involved in
1126 it. The parties said that they, this was really the first
1127 time for them locally to have a measurement of their support
1128 in the Russian electorate.
1129 And the elected officials, and the election administrators
1130 were very positive about use of the system. They intend to
1131 use it again. And we've been working with the Commission to
1132 try to disseminate information on that election for
1133 consideration by other regions, if they're planning to use a
1134 mixed system.
1135 So really, the debate is going on at two different levels.
1136 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) How is the voter registry
1137 compiled?
1138 Mr. DAHL. It's done by local authorities in
1139 Ms. MCCORMACK. It's often handwritten.
1140 Ms. BARNES. It's often handwritten. It --
1141 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) By just going around door to
1142 door?
1143 Ms. MCCORMACK. Canvassing. That's what I understand.
1144 Ms. BARNES. They canvas. Yes. They canvasinterestingly
1145 enough, in April, 1993, when the referendum was conducted,
1146 that was on confidence in Yeltsin and that system, some of
1147 the polling sites were actually using lists for the
1148 disbursement of privitization vouchers, if you remember that
1149 process. Because those lists were more up to date than the

1150 voter registries.

1151 The whole exercise of April, 1993, however, provided a
1152 good opportunity to update the lists. The problem is that
1153 they aren'tyou know, a lot of them are handwritten. There
1154 are special lists. There are no mechanisms for really
1155 insuring that someone who is voting outside of their
1156 district has not voted several times.

1157 Interestingly enough, one of the priorities that the
1158 Central Election Commission has established for 1995 is
1159 automation of the voter registry. And if they can get the
1160 technology put into place, and the mechanisms for doing
1161 that, they will have an automated voter registry.

1162 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) I think that's a great question,
1163 because one of the great opportunities for fraud is when
1164 there are names on the list of people who --

1165 Ms. BARNES. Sure.

1166 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) who have died, or are not there.
1167 Or you will omit the names of people who might vote against
1168 the interest of whoever is

1169 Ms. BARNES. That's right. One of the comments thatone of
1170 the things that we have been encouraging with the CEC, too,
1171 is the publication of lists by address, as opposed by
1172 alphabetical order. Because they tend to be in alphabetical
1173 order, and it's very difficult to go over those lists, and
1174 review them for accuracy.

1175 Mr. DAHL. Neighbors can recognize on a list that's
1176 compiled by street address if a name next to them doesn't
1177 make sense. But if it's alphabetical, those ghost voters, or
1178 padded voters, or dead voters, are just mixed together, and
1179 you can't tell.
1180 Ms. MCCORMACK. Computerized systems, which of course we
1181 all have, we sort them every which way, and we have
1182 everything available at every precinct, with every type cftc
1183 completely computerize that process. And the years
1184 Mr. DAHL. the law does provide for --
1185 Ms. MCCORMACK. One would hope that they could make a start
1186 on that process.
1187 Mr. DAHL. The law provides for posting of the --
1188 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) How many style address, though,
1189 do they have?
1190 Mr. DAHL. Well, I mean, obviously out in rural areas, but
1191 in, you know, inin Moscow, and the major cities, it's
1192 buildings, and blocs.
1193 Ms. BARNES. There are very few single, single family
1194 homes, except obviously in the rural areas, where there's
1195 fewer numbers of voters in each polling site.
1196 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) any decision of getting rid of
1197 the 25 percent?
1198 Mr. DAHL. I don'tI think that's kind of a cultural --
1199 Ms. BARNES. They seem very wed to that.

1200 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) Because it was 50 percent.

1201 Ms. BARNES. Yes. It's going down. Maybe after a number of

1202 successes. When people get tired ofI think the process that

1203 we're seeing in Ukraine, where there are constant run-off

1204 elections, and that's affecting the process, the ability to

1205 get people to turn out, and their interest in elections, in

1206 democratic elections.

1207 But at this point, they're veryseem very committed to the

1208 25 percent.

1209 Mr. DAHL. It was 50 percent for the Constitutional

1210 Referendum last December, and remains a 50 percent threshold

1211 for the long referendum that'sthe draft that's being

1212 proposed. Sowhich I think makes some sense, because

1213 referenda are supreme law once they're enacted. So, they're

1214 going to maintain the 50 percent for referenda, and 25

1215 percent for other elections.

1216 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) In thefrom an educational point

1217 of view, do you still have thewhat I want to say, the

1218 feeling that the, especially once the governmenta sense of

1219 doing this because so'n'so has been the big man on campus,

1220 so to speakhe's going to get the vote, anyway. How do you

1221 change that thinking?

1222 Mr. HOLCOMB. Do you mean specifically a vote on the campus

1223 for campus leaders?

1224 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) the voting process, as compared

1225 to, say, a business process. you want to see the Russian
1226 businesses, the old managers are going to be the bosses
1227 today, whether they're good guys, or not.
1228 But they have to be there, so they continue. Think back
1229 inin the old days, before Communism, still had the local
1230 administrationwho was there, you trust this guy, he's going
1231 to be there. This apathy that was on the --
1232 Now, you're going to bring in new bloodget them to, shall
1233 we say, give them backbone to get up and say, ''Hey, this is
1234 what I'm going to do.''
1235 Mr. HOLCOMB. Well, first of all, I would agree with you,
1236 that that is, and continues to be a problem. People who were
1237 seen as in charge tend to have an edge to gettc maintaining
1238 those roles, particularly outside of the larger cities, I
1239 think.
1240 So, there is that tendency. With regard to young people, I
1241 think they're starting from a different baseline. The
1242 difficulty there is that there have been very few
1243 institutions to train anyone in society to serve a
1244 leadership role. There are very few organizations outside of
1245 government. There are very few non-governmental institutions
1246 that allow people to develop leadership.
1247 I mean, try to imagine a country that, you know, no one
1248 has made a Kiwanis Club speech for 40 or 70 years. I mean,
1249 there simply aren't the means by which people develop those

1250 skills, whether that's --

1251 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) Which is why the parties have

1252 been so miserable --

1253 Mr. HOLCOMB. Exactly. So, one of the things that we've

1254 worked with in other countries, notably Romania, is that

1255 we've developed a number of leadership programs, in which we

1256 try to develop both adults and young people, the ability to

1257 manage effectively, to set up work plans, to run meetings,

1258 to be effective public speakers.

1259 I mean, these skills simply are not well developed in most

1260 of these areas. We haven't done that specific program in

1261 Russia, but I think some other organizations are working in

1262 that area.

1263 Of the three pilot programs I mentioned, the one in Kazan

1264 was more specific to developing young leaders than it was to

1265 mass voter education. They specifically had as one of their

1266 goals to encourage young people to speak publicly, to run

1267 meetings, and to discuss legislation.

1268 This is something we do routinely in the United States. I

1269 mean, virtually every school has some kind of school

1270 elections, a large number of school clubs, and encourages

1271 people to be part of organizations. This is a society that

1272 simply did not have that tradition in any form.

1273 Now, with regard to society at large, and adults, and

1274 older members of society, I think it's going to be much more

1275 difficult to change that. Not impossible, but just more
1276 difficult. So, over a period of time, those tendencies will
1277 continue. But as new people join the system, let's hope that
1278 there will be new institutions in which people can
1279 participate in leadership roles.
1280 That's a difficult thing to deal with. We hear frequently
1281 these comments like, well, there's nothing like former
1282 Communists involved in institutions in these countries. If
1283 you flip the coin, and if the flip thing had happened in
1284 this country, and you defined a former democrat as anyone
1285 who was not a member of the communist party, you can see
1286 that 99, and 99/100th's percent of the American people would
1287 have been former democrats.
1288 Well, the same thing there. Virtually everyone in a
1289 leadership role would have been in some way involved in
1290 Socialism. So, these are the people with the management
1291 skills and the background. So, our only hope is, over a
1292 period of years, to lead to development programs in which
1293 more people will understand this prospect of democracy and
1294 democratic institutions.
1295 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) What sort of resources have you
1296 used in order to implement programsand how muchcan they
1297 make?
1298 Mr. HOLCOMB. Well, you can look at that on several
1299 levels. Whether you're dealing with the Ministry of

1300 Education, you get one response, or the Central Election
1301 Commission, another. With regard to teachers, they over
1302 and over said, basically, we have no materials. We have
1303 nothing in the way of resources that we can use to teach
1304 with.

1305 So, I think that was the first motivation we had, which
1306 was to provide materials. Nevertheless, you can't bring in
1307 simply foreign materials, and expect the people in any
1308 country to begin to teach with that. So, our goal has been
1309 to adapt foreign materials, that is, American materials,
1310 Canadian, British, European, other countries, and to
1311 encourage Russian to translate and adapt those materials,
1312 and write their own that are appropriate for their culture,
1313 so that those people will then have materials to teach with.

1314 This is why we developed the conference specifically to
1315 design a new curriculum. Now, in our resource center, we're
1316 accumulated a vast store of voter education materials. And
1317 at the conference, provided a set of over 40 document on
1318 voter education that were available in other countries.

1319 All of those were translated into Russian. And that was a
1320 major part of our effort. And they were each provided with a
1321 notebook about this, of materials, in Russian, used as
1322 resource material.

1323 But these were not designed to be taken specifically to
1324 the classroom. Their purpose is then to take those

1325 materials, and adapt them to the Russian situation, in the
1326 Russian classroom.
1327 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) The last election last year,
1328 there were, if my memory serves me right, somewhere around
1329 12, 13, 14 parties?
1330 Ms. BARNES. Well, that are registered. There werethere is
1331 a great difference between the parties that gained access to
1332 the ballots, and the numbers that claimed to exist.
1333 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) Do you feel that thesethese
1334 parties are going to increase or diminish as time goes on?
1335 Mr. DAHL. I think the natural expectation is, they'll
1336 diminish, once they start to realize, number one, the new
1337 laws have thresholds for representation. So, five to seven
1338 percent, five percent for parties, and seven percent for
1339 blocs, for coalitions.
1340 So, that starts to weed them out right there. And it's a
1341 gamble to say, no, we're going to go on our own. We don't
1342 want to join with you. We agree with you on nine things, but
1343 a tenth issue we disagree on, so we're going to be a
1344 separate party.
1345 On the other hand, in other former Communist countries
1346 where I've worked, even the thresholds of, you know, five
1347 percent or so don't discourage people, because all this
1348 stuff is based on personalities, you know? They want
1349 tosomeone wants to be chairman of their own party, wants to

1350 run their own party.

1351 And so, I think it'll take a while for political reality

1352 to sink in. And after you lose, you know, eight of those 13

1353 parties actually were awarded seats last time, five who were

1354 registered, and who crossed the significant threshold

1355 requirements for registration still didn't elect any

1356 candidates.

1357 And so, I think over time, that they will continue to

1358 diminish the number of parties, but I don't think that

1359 that'll happen immediately.

1360 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) Yes, pardon my lateness at this

1361 issueI had very little knowledge of what this forum would

1362 be. I expected that there might be Russian representatives

1363 here in this forum that could speak from their perspective.

1364 And to that issue, are there Russian electoral experts here

1365 in Washington, at their embassy, or that can be consulted?

1366 And secondlythe idea to go to the public withwith that

1367 perspective?

1368 Ms. BARNES. Basically, in terms of officials, there are to

1369 my knowledge not election experts who are working at the

1370 Russian embassy here in Washington. Through our exchange

1371 program, however, we have made an effort to bring Russian

1372 officials to the United States not only to observe our

1373 process, but to contribute to our understanding of their

1374 process.

1375 Two recent events, first as Mr. Soudrette mentioned,
1376 Chairman Byabov came to the United States to observe the
1377 U.S. by-elections. He held meetings with the Federal
1378 Election Commission, with the D.C. Board of Elections, with
1379 a number of people, before going out of Tulsa, Oklahoma.
1380 When he was in Tulsa, Oklahoma, he presented a class at
1381 the University of Tulsa, which was extremely well-attended.
1382 There were over 70 people who came to that, to hear him
1383 discuss reform in the Russian electoral system.
1384 So, there has been an effort, when IFES brings Russians to
1385 the United States not only to involve them in training
1386 programs, but also to have them provide information to the
1387 U.S. public on the electoral system in Russia.
1388 Interestingly also, we brought the Secretary of the
1389 Commission to the United States to participate in the annual
1390 conference of IACREOT, which is the International
1391 Association of Clerks, Recorders, Election Officials and
1392 Treasurers. That's North American Professional Association of
1393 Election Officials.
1394 The Russians came to that conference, again as attendees,
1395 to go to workshops, to go to vendor fairs, etc. But again,
1396 they also did a presentation which was attended by almost
1397 200 U.S. election officials, to discuss their electoral
1398 systems, and the forums that were under way.
1399 It's interesting that they are veryfind very novel the

1400 concept of professional election associations, which is
1401 something that we are trying to involve them in, not only by
1402 bringing into the United States, but also European election
1403 associations.

1404 And Russian will be sending a delegation next week to Kiev
1405 for the annual conference of the Association of Central and
1406 East European Election Officials. All these associations
1407 seem to have very long names, which represents East European
1408 election Commissions.

1409 They will all be sending Chairmen, Vice-Chairmen, and
1410 Commissioners. The Europeans, Canadians, and Americans, and
1411 Australians, I believe, as well as the French, will be
1412 sending election officials to basically compare notes on
1413 their systems. A lot of them experience similar problems,
1414 but they come up with alternative solutions. And so, we're
1415 going to bring them together to discuss that.

1416 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) that would be next week?

1417 Ms. BARNES. Next weekend. The 15th through the 17th of
1418 December.

1419 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) And where are you having it?

1420 Ms. BARNES. In Kiev, Ukraine.

1421 Ms. MCCORMACK. I'll be there.

1422 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) When is the next time, Ms.
1423 Barnes, when the next time the Russians may come over here
1424 for such a conference? Is there a foreseeable coming?

1425 Ms. BARNES. Probably, depending on the situation in
1426 Russia, and the legislation that they have before the Duma,
1427 which they have to defend, the Vice-Chairman of the Election
1428 Commission is slated to make a trip to the United States
1429 under sponsorship from the International Foundation for
1430 Electoral Systems, to go through an intensive training
1431 program here with election authorities. So, probably in the
1432 next three to six months.

1433 Ms. MCCORMACK. Is there a question in the back?

1434 UNIDENTIFIED. (Off mike.) I don't understand very much
1435 about coalition government, if you have eight or ten
1436 parties. Do they have coalition government, the national
1437 elections in Russia?

1438 Mr. DAHL. They don't because it's not a parliamentary
1439 system, per se. They have, you know, the president is
1440 elected separately. So, there's no there's eight parties
1441 represented in the Parliament, in the Assembly.

1442 But, you know, the Administration is still just Yeltsin's
1443 people. And his Cabinet serves, you know, under political
1444 constraints, and he shuffles this Cabinet to deal with
1445 political constraints and pressures. But it's not a
1446 coalition government, per se.

1447 Ms. BARNES. Well, I'd like to at this time thank everyone
1448 for attending. And I'd like to thank Mr. Finerty of CSCE for
1449 helping us set up this briefing, and we appreciate that very

1450 much.

1451 And if you have any further questions, or would like more
1452 information from the International Foundation, about not
1453 only our systems in Russia, programs in Russia, but also the
1454 former Soviet Union, and around the world, please make sure
1455 that you are on our sign-in sheet, or talk to one of us.
1456 We'll make sure that we can get you on our mailing list.
1457 Thank you very much.

1458 [Whereupon, the briefing was concluded at 3:30 p.m.]